UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA Richmond Division

KATHERINE REYNOLDS,

Plaintiff,

v. Civil Action No. 3:09cv238

RELIABLE TRANSMISSIONS, INC., et al,

Defendants.

DECLARATION OF DALE W. PITTMAN

Dale W. Pittman declares under penalty of perjury that the following statements are true:

1. I am a member in good standing of the bars of the following courts:

Supreme Court of the United States Washington, DC February, 1997

Supreme Court of Virginia Richmond, Virginia June 8, 1976

U. S. Court of Appeals for the Fourth Circuit Richmond, Virginia September 2, 1980

U. S. District Court for the Western District of Virginia Roanoke, Virginia

U. S. District Court for the Eastern District of Virginia Richmond, Virginia December 30, 1976

U. S. Bankruptcy Court for the Eastern District of Virginia Richmond, Virginia November, 1997.

- 2. I am a 1971 graduate of Hampden-Sydney College and a 1976 graduate of the T.
- C. Williams School of Law of the University of Richmond, Virginia. I am a member of the

Virginia State Bar, the Virginia Trial Lawyers Association, the Virginia Bar Association, the National Association of Consumer Advocates, and the Petersburg Bar Association, of which I am a past President. Until June, 2007, I was a member of the Council of the Virginia State Bar, the State Bar's governing body, serving for two terms as the elected representative of the Eleventh Judicial Circuit. I am a member of the Board of Governors of the Virginia Trial Lawyers Association, and I chair the VTLA's Consumer Law Section.

- 3. From February 1, 1977 until September 13, 1996, I was employed by Southside Virginia Legal Services, in Petersburg, Virginia, as its General Counsel (Chief Executive Officer). My caseload at Southside Virginia Legal Services evolved over the years into a primarily consumer law practice.
- 4. From September 16, 1996, until the present, I have maintained a private law practice with an office located in Petersburg. My work in private practice is limited almost exclusively to the representation of consumers, with particular emphasis on representing consumer debtors under the Fair Debt Collections Practices Act. I have developed a statewide consumer law practice, and have represented consumers from all regions of the Commonwealth and elsewhere.
- 5. I was a contributing editor to the consumer law sections of <u>Virginia Practice</u>

 <u>Manual</u>, a practice manual for Legal Aid lawyers in Virginia, and for private lawyers handling cases under the auspices of *pro bono* initiatives in Virginia.
- 6. Pleadings and discovery from many of my consumer law cases appear in the National Consumer Law Center's <u>Consumer Law Pleadings</u>, nationally distributed form books of consumer law pleadings, beginning in 1994. Pleadings and discovery from my cases appear in Books 1, 2, 5, 6, 7, 10, and 11.

- 7. I have given at least sixty lectures to lawyers that qualified for continuing legal education credit.
- 8. I have made two presentations to Virginia's General District Court judges at the Judicial Conference of Virginia for General District Court judges, one in 1987 and one on August 13, 2008.
- 9. I have given a number of lectures to professional groups on consumer law issues, including:

Debt Collection: Protecting Consumers in Debt Collection and Arbitration	Federal Trade Commission Roundtable, Washington, DC	December 4, 2009
Handling Fair Debt Collections Practices Act Cases	65 th Legal Assistance Course, The Judge Advocate General's Legal Center and School, Charlottesville	November 16, 2009
Handling Fair Debt Collections Practices Act Cases	VPLC Statewide Legal Aid Conference, Williamsburg	November 5, 2009
Challenging Predatory Small Loans	National Consumer Law Center Consumer Rights Litigation Conference, Philadelphia	October 23, 2009
The Fair Debt Collections Practices Act: Update 2009	VA CLE Webinar	September, 2009
Handling Fair Debt Collections Practices Act Cases	2009 Mid-Atlantic Joint Services Consumer Law Symposium, Naval Legal Service Office Mid-Atlantic Legal Assistance Department, Norfolk	June 12, 2009
Handling Fair Debt Collections Practices Act Cases	64 th Legal Assistance Course, The Judge	April 2, 2009

	Advocate General's Legal Center and School, Charlottesville	
Defending Consumers in Medical Debt Collection Cases	National Consumer Law Center's Consumer Rights Litigation Conference in Portland, Oregon	October, 2008
Combating Consumer Issues Facing the Military, FDCPA Cases	Consumer Law Intensive for Military Personnel Advocates, National Consumer Law Center's Consumer Rights Litigation Conference in Portland, Oregon	October, 2008
Issues in Arbitration Cases	Judicial Conference of Virginia for District Court Judges, Virginia Beach	August 13, 2008
A Perfect Storm – The Intersection of the FDCPA and the FCRA in Debt Collection Harassment Cases	Virginia CLE Solo and Small Firm Institute, Williamsburg	May 13, 2008
Defending Debt Collection Suits	National Consumer Rights Litigation Conference, Washington, D.C.	November 11, 2007
Emerging Issues in Debt Collection Abuse & False Credit Reporting	Virginia Trial Lawyers Association Solo & Small Firm Conference, Richmond	October 19, 2007
Collecting Consumer Debts: The Challenges of Change. Concerns About Debt Collection: The Consumer's Perspective	Federal Trade Commission, Washington, D.C.	October 10, 2007
The Fair Debt Collections Practices Act (Including 2006 Amendments)	Virginia CLE	September 24, 2007
Fair Debt Collections Practices Act	Naval Legal Service	May 11, 2007

	Office Mid-Atlantic Joint Services Consumer Law Symposium, Norfolk	
How to Win (or Not Lose) an Arbitration	National Consumer Rights Litigation Conference Miami, Florida	November 11, 2006
Consumer Debt Collection	59 th Legal Assistance Course The Judge Advocate's School Charlottesville	November 2, 2006
Consumer Credit: Remedies You Should be Aware of	Virginia Trial Lawyers Association Solo & Small Firm Conference, Williamsburg	October 20, 2006
Collection Law From Start to Finish (Presentation on the FDCPA)	National Business Institute Richmond	October 10, 2006
Overview of the Fair Debt Collections Practices Act	Framme Law Firm, Richmond	June 23, 2006
Fair Debt Collection Practices Act	Naval Justice School Newport, Rhode Island	May 22, 2006
Fair Debt Collection Practices Act – Essential Tips for Both Debtors and Creditors	Virginia CLE - 4 th Annual Advanced Consumer Bankruptcy, Richmond	April 28, 2006
Fair Debt Collection Practices Act	3 rd Annual Naval Legal Service Office, Mid- Atlantic, Auto Fraud Symposium, Norfolk	April 12, 2006
What the Virginia Lawyer Must Know about Consumer Protection	Solo and Small Firm Conference – Virginia Trial Lawyers Association,	September 30, 2005

	Charlottesville	
Points to consider if You are Going to Arbitration	National Consumer Law Center's 13 th Annual Consumer Rights Litigation Conference	November 7, 2004
Protecting Your Client's Consumer Rights – Fair Debt Collections Practices Act	Virginia CLE - Richmond and Tysons Corner	April 21 and 22, 2004
Fair Debt Collections Practices Act Training Conference – Practice Issues	National Consumer Law Center and National Association of Consumer Advocates, Kansas City	February 22, 2004
Fair Debt Collections Practices Act	Henrico County Bar Association and Virginia Creditor's Bar Association, Richmond	February 19, 2004
Using Experts in Automobile Sale Wreck Damage Cases	IVAN Diminished Value Conference, Chesapeake	January 31, 2004
Consumer Law: Everything You Need to Know to be an Expert in Handling the Latest in Consumer Cases	First Annual Solo and Small Firm Conference – Virginia Trial Lawyers Association, Charlottesville	October 10, 2003
Points To Consider If You Are Going To Arbitration	Virginia Women Attorney's Association, Southside Chapter, Petersburg	July 31, 2003
Fair Debt Collection Practices Act	Virginia CLE, First Advanced Consumer Bankruptcy Conference	May 2, 2003
Fair Debt Collection Practices Act Fair Credit Reporting Act	Naval Justice School Newport, Rhode Island	April 3, 2003
Overview of the Fair Debt Collections Practices Act	Framme Law Firm, Richmond	December 17 & 18, 2002
Arbitrating: Who's Afraid of the Big Bad	National Consumer Law	October 26,

Wolf?	Center Consumer Rights Litigation Conference, Atlanta	2002
Mobile Home Litigation Issues	National Consumer Law Center Consumer Rights Litigation Conference, Atlanta	October 25, 2002
Settlement Agreements and Confidentiality Issues: Recent Cases in the News and the Problems News Attention Can Create	Virginia Trial Lawyers Association Fall Fiesta, Richmond	September 28, 2002
Practice Pointers Roundtable	Virginia Trial Lawyers Association Fall Fiesta, Richmond	September 27, 2002
Arbitration and Beyond: What to Do If You Are Forced Into Arbitration and What Happens After the Arbitral Award	Virginia Trial Lawyers Association Fall Fiesta, Richmond	September 27, 2002
Fair Debt Collection	ABA Standing Committee on Legal Assistance for Military Personnel Legal Assistance Symposium, Quantico	August 15, 2002
Practical Applications of Consumer Protection Laws for the General Practitioner – Part II	Virginia Women Attorneys Association, Southside Chapter, Petersburg	June 27, 2002
Practical Applications of Consumer Protection Laws for the General Practitioner – Part I	Virginia Women Attorneys Association, Southside Chapter, Petersburg	April 25, 2002
Federal Court-Fun & Easy	Annual Statewide Legal Aid Conference, Virginia Beach	November 1, 2001
FDCPA Compliance for the Virginia Practitioner	National Business Institute CLE for Virginia Lawyers, Richmond	October 11, 2001

Use of Magnuson-Moss Warranty Act in the Recovery of Attorney's Fees	Virginia Trial Lawyers Association Fiesta 3, Richmond	September 28, 2001
Credit Reporting Abuse	Petersburg Kiwanis Breakfast Club, Petersburg	September 18, 2001
A Consumer Lawyer's Perspective on Mobile Home Transactions	Virginia Manufactured Housing Association, Virginia Beach	August 8, 2001
Debt Collection Harassment, Credit Reporting Abuse, Home Solicitation Sales, Fraud.	Elder Law Day	May 11, 2001
Truth in Lending Act and Title Issues in Car Sales	VA Independent Automobile Dealers Association, District 1 Dinner Meeting, Virginia Beach, Virginia	April 11, 2001
What do these attorneys know about the used car business that you don't?	VA Independent Automobile Dealers Association, District 2 Dinner Meeting, Richmond, Virginia	January 30, 2001
Mobile Home Litigation Issues	National Consumer Law Center Consumer Rights Conference	October 28, 2000
Update on the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act	Virginia CLE®	July 12 and 19, 2000
Consumer Privacy in the Electronic Age	The Bar Association of the City of Richmond	May 31, 2000
Consumer Law Update for Virginia Practitioners, Fair Debt Collection Practices Act.	Virginia CLE®	December 7 and 8, 1999
Recent Developments in Fair Debt Collection, With an Emphasis on the Fourth Circuit	Annual Statewide Legal Aid Conference	November 3, 1999

Recent Developments in Fair Debt Collection	The Bankruptcy Section of the Bar Association of the City of Richmond	October 26, 1999
Consumer Law Seminar	Office of the Staff Judge Advocate, Ft. Eustis, Virginia	August 27, 1999
Automobile Fraud and Financing Issues	Annual Statewide Legal Aid Conference	November 11, 1998
Consumer Law for Support Staff	Annual Statewide Legal Aid Conference	November 11, 1998
First Day in Practice (Topic: Consumer Law Practice)	Virginia State Bar	November 3, 1998
Complying with the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act in Virginia	National Business Institute CLE for Virginia Lawyers	September 9, 1998
Basic Overview of Several Consumer Protection Laws Available to Assist Victims of Consumer Fraud and Abuse	Charlottesville- Albemarle Bar Association Bankruptcy/Creditors' Rights Committee	February 10, 1998
Overview of Consumer Law for Support Staff	Annual Statewide Legal Aid Conference	November 6, 1997
The Fair Debt Collection Practices Act	Annual Statewide Legal Aid Conference	November 6, 1997
Recent Developments under the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act	Virginia Creditor's Bar Association	September 25, 1997
Fair Debt Collection Practices Act	10 th Circuit Bar Association	April 23, 1997
Complying With the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act in Virginia	National Business Institute CLE for Virginia Lawyers	February 11, 1997
Handling Repossession Cases (gave	Virginia Legal Services	

segment on odometer law)	Consumer Law Task Force	
State and Federal Consumer Protection Statutes Frequently Applicable to General District Court Cases	Judicial Conference of Virginia General District Court Judges	April 29, 1989
Everything Under the Sun You Ever Wanted to Know About Handling Home Improvement Cases	Elderly Law Task Force of Virginia Legal Services Programs	
Consumer Law for Non Consumer Lawyers	Virginia Legal Services Attorneys	
Handling Home Improvement Cases	Consumer Law Training for Virginia Legal Services Attorneys	

- 10. The Summer 2006 edition of *The Journal of the Virginia Trial Lawyers*Association, included "Disputing Home Loan Servicing Abuse Through RESPA," an article that I prepared for that publication.
- 11. Since 2001, I have prepared annual reports on Virginia law for the American Bar Association's *Survey of State Class Action Law*.
- 12. I was Section Chairman and Program Moderator for a Virginia Trial Lawyers
 Association Consumer Law Seminar entitled "Keeping the Big Boys Honest," that took place on
 April 25, 1997, and covered the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, the Fair Credit Reporting
 Act, Consumer Class Actions, Motor Vehicle Litigation, and Recovering Attorney's Fees in
 Consumer Litigation. I was Program Chair for the Consumer Law portion of the VTLA's
 February Fiesta CLE that took place in Williamsburg in February, 2000. I was a presenter on
 Mobile Home Sales, and in a Consumer Law Practice Roundtable. I was Program Chair for the
 Consumer Law portion of the VTLA's Fall Fiesta that took place in Williamsburg on October 14

and 15, 2000, and was a presenter on Emerging Issues in Mobile Home Sales Fraud. I was program Chair for the Consumer Law portion of the VTLA's Fiesta 3 that took place in Richmond on September 28 and 29, 2001, and was a presenter on "Use of the Magnuson-Moss Warranty Act to Recover Attorney's Fees." I was program Chair for the Consumer Law portion of the VTLA's Fiesta 2002 that took place in Richmond on September 27 and 28, 2002, and was a presenter on "Settlement Agreements and Confidentiality Issues: Recent Cases in the News and the Problems News Attention Can Create," "Arbitration and Beyond: What to Do If You Are Forced Into Arbitration and What Happens After the Arbitral Award," and a roundtable participant in a "Practice Pointers Roundtable."

13. I have been involved in many consumer cases involving a range of consumer protection laws, with an emphasis on the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act. Fair Debt Collection Practices Act cases that I have handled alone or co-counseled with others include Withers v. Eveland, 988 F. Supp. 942 (E.D. Va. 1997); Creighton v. Emporia Credit Service, Inc., 981 F. Supp. 411 (E.D. Va. 1997); Morgan v. Credit Adjustment Board, 999 F. Supp. 803 (E.D.Va. 1998); Talbott v. GC Services Limited Partnership, 53 F. Supp. 2d 846 (W.D. Va. 1999); Talbott v. GC Services Limited Partnership, 191 F.R.D. 99 (W.D. Va. 2000); Woodard v. Online Information Servs., 191 F.R.D. 502 (E.D.N.C., Jan. 19, 2000); Jones v. Robert Vest, 2000 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 18413 (E.D. Va. 2000); Kelly v. Jormandy, 2005 U.S. Dist. Lexis 29901 (W.D. Va. 2005); Turner v. Shenandoah Legal Group, P.C., 2006 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 39341 (E.D.Va., June 12, 2006); Karnette v. Wolpoff & Abramson L.L.C., 2007 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 53382 (E.D. Va. Aug. 2, 2006); Croy v. E. Hall & Associates, P.L.L.C., 2007 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 14830 (W.D. Va. 2007); and Karnette v. Wolpoff & Abramson, L.L.P., 2007 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 14830 (W.D. Va. 2007); and Karnette v. Wolpoff & Abramson, L.L.P., 2007 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 20794 (E.D. Va. March 23, 2007). I was one of several lawyers representing plaintiff classes in a

Multidistrict FDCPA class action, styled <u>In Re Dun & Bradstreet</u>, <u>Inc. Debt Collection Practices</u>
<u>Litigation</u>, MDL #1198. The cases, originally transferred by the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict
Litigation to the Western District of Virginia, Danville Division, for consolidated pretrial
proceedings, were centralized before the Northern District of Illinois for purposes of finalizing
settlement. Classes were certified by Judges Kiser and Boyle in the <u>Talbott</u> and <u>Woodard</u> cases.
Judge Wilson certified a class in <u>Gansauer v. Transworld Systems</u>, <u>Inc.</u>, Civil Action No.
7:00cv00931, a case under the Fair Debt Collections Practices Act. Judge Conrad certified a
class in <u>Kashani v. Integrity Collections</u>, Civil Action No. 5:06cv73, a case under the Fair Debt
Collections Practices Act.

- 14. I served as Special Master in the case styled <u>Silva v. Haynes Furniture Company</u>, <u>Inc.</u>, Civil Action No. 4:04cv082, E.D.Va., an ECOA/FCRA class action, having been appointed by Judge Kelley on January 27, 2006.
- 15. On November 9, 2007, I received the 2007 Consumer Attorney of the Year Award from the National Association of Consumer Advocates at its Annual Meeting in Washington, D.C.
- 16. I am familiar with the Virginia Lawyers Weekly Article described in Mr. Bennett's related declaration and in fact was quoted in the article. Alan D. Wingfield's statement that consumer protection litigation is "a specialized area, and [...] requires knowing what you're doing" is very true. The interplay between the range of consumer protection laws, both state and federal, and in particular the integration between consumer credit and separate consumer fraud protection statutes is complex and subjects the inexperienced attorney to significant pitfalls and obstacles. Though much of this work is in complex regulated fields, many of the statutory provisions or legal concepts involved remain "cutting edge" and are subject to misinterpretation

by opposing arguments. It is essential that a consumer plaintiff be represented by an attorney with specialized consumer protection experience and knowledge.

- 17. I have personal knowledge of the attorneys who practice on the consumer side of the fence in this field in the Eastern District of Virginia. I estimate that there are fewer than eight with significant consumer protection litigation experience in federal court and only one or two with experience comparable to Mr. Bennett's.
- 18. I have known Mr. Bennett for over a decade and have co-counseled a number of federal cases with him. I have also followed his practice and his contributions to the development of law in the consumer protection field. I am also aware of his work outside the state and have co-taught, participated in, and observed continuing legal education programs in which he instructed.
- 19. Having handled consumer protection cases since 1977, I have been in the position to observe, more or less "from the beginning," the development of both the field of consumer protection law and the body of federal and state consumer protection law on which this area of practice is based.
- 20. Similarly, I have known and followed the development of the legal practices of the vast majority of consumer protection practitioners representing consumers in America, and, as far as I am able to determine, all such practitioners in Virginia.
- 21. I have for a number of years held the view that Mr. Bennett ranks at the very top of America's consumer protection plaintiff's bar. I would be hard pressed to argue with anyone who takes the position that Mr. Bennett is the top plaintiff's side FCRA litigator in the country. The depth of his personal knowledge of the nature, workings and practices of the credit reporting industry is vast, and, in my view, in excess of pretty much any other lawyer in the United States.

- 22. More generally, I have had an opportunity to survey the current hourly rates charged in this District and Division, as well as in the consumer protection field. My current billing rate is \$425 per hour. Given the specific knowledge I have as to hourly rates charged and approved in this District and Division, I am comfortable stating that the average hourly rates for federal litigation attorneys in this District and Division range between \$300 and at least \$600, depending upon the market targeted by the law firm (for example, insurance defense work is typically paid at rates at the lower ends of this range, while specialized consumer credit defense attorneys at national firms are paid towards the higher end). Mr. Bennett's hourly rate in this market clearly rests at the top half of this range and should not be at the \$450 level that I understand him to be seeking in this case. I personally believe that he should bill at and receive a rate of at least \$500 per hour.
- 23. I am thus aware that Mr. Bennett charges an hourly rate of \$450. This rate is well within the range of reasonable hourly rates for attorneys specialized in this field and as well for attorneys of Mr. Bennett's experience practicing in this District and Division.

I declare under penalty of perjury of the laws of the United States that the foregoing is correct.

Signed this 28th day of May, 2010.

Dale W. Pittman, VSB #15673

THE LAW OFFICE OF DALE W. PITTMAN, P.C. The Eliza Spotswood House 112-A West Tabb Street Petersburg, VA 23803-3212 (804) 861-6000 (804) 861-3368 (Fax)

dale@pittmanlawoffice.com